

Notes on the manuscript: Lofty aspirations born of sacrifice...

Dear author,

this manuscript is interesting twofold: as a memory of Ms. Ma, the first female geologist in China, and as an account of the sociological and scientific conditions in China in the 1940s. However it has to be shortened considerably, and it needs to be formulated more specifically and more concise. Here is my detailed criticism and my suggestions for improvement:

1. The present title is not adequate for a scientific journal. It should be changed to something like: The fate of Y.S. Ma, China's first female geologist.
2. Abstract: the lines 10 to 18 should be moved to the beginning of the introduction. The abstract may start: „In April 1944 during the War of Resistance against Japan, three young scientist...“
3. line 68: please explain the „September 18 incident“
4. line 81: „foundation“ is not the appropriate expression here, you may use „basic knowledge“
5. line 103: please explain „ostracod“
6. The content of lines 109 to 122 should be included into the section 2.
7. The lines 123 to 174 may be omitted. According to the title the manuscript should focus on Ms. Ma and her two colleagues Hsu and Chen. The fate of Mr. Chao may be mentioned in one or two brief sentences.
8. The content of lines 202 to 268 should be considerably shortened. The biographies of Mr. Hsu and Mr. Chen should be concentrated to the basic facts.
9. Section 4 should be shortened as well to the basic facts.
10. Section 5 can be omitted completely. Its content does not contribute substantial information on the fate of Ms. Ma and her two colleagues. The commendation to the three murdered scientist (lines 468 to 473) and the compensation to their families (lines 557 to 560) may be briefly mentioned.
11. Most of the content of section 6 may be omitted. Some important information about the GSC (lines 507 to 540) can be included in the introduction. The last paragraphs of this section (lines 548 to 568) can remain.
12. A general remark: The author should avoid too many names of Chinese people. It is quite confusing for the reader to distinguish between people whose names differ only in the initials (e.g. T.Y. Hsu and T.L. Hsu; K. Chen and M.S. Chen). Names should only be written in case of important persons.