

Article Reviewed: **Geological investigations of the Lizard District, Cornwall, England: 1818-1883** by Carl N Drummond <https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2025-5>.

GENERAL: Very nice analysis and well organized.

SUGGESTIONS AND COMMENTS:

1. When quoting from another publication it is my understanding (based on the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 13th edition, sections 10.36 to 10.49) ellipses are used to indicate omitted material. I think it would make the quotes in the text clearer if ellipses were used, e.g. pages 3 and 4 with the quote from Majendie – ellipses added in red:

In 1818 Ashurst Majendie, a founding member of the Geological Society of London, conducted a study in which he hoped “...to offer to the Society an account of the boundaries and position of the serpentine formation, occurring in the vicinity of the Lizard Promontory...” (Majendie, 1818, p. 32).

Also, shouldn't the *et al.* when used in a citation be in italics? Same for e.g.? That is not the case in the paper.

SPECIFIC QUESTIONS/SUGGESTIONS:

1. Page 9, line 262 – mention of the work of T. Sterry Hunt (the first of several), but no reference is given. It would be nice for the readers to have a reference or two to Dr. Hunt's work related to the subject under discussion.
2. Page 9, line 279 – reference to a figure in the work of King and Rowney 1876 – would it be possible to add that figure to this article so the readers can see the “..surrealistic qualities.”?
3. Page 11, line 328 – part of a quotation with () in it. I assume the () is in the original, but it would be clearer to the reader if it was stated in the reference that the () is in the original, and not added by the author of the article. Just keeps things clearer.
4. Page 12, caption for Figure 3 – is the citation 1877a or 1877b? There are two Bonney 1877 references from which to choose.
5. Page 13 – caption for Figure 4 – same as number 4 above; is the citation for 1877a or 1877b?
6. Page 15 – caption for Figure 5 – same as numbers 4 and 5 above; is the citation for 1877a or 1877b?
7. Page 16, lines 466 and 474 – citations for “Bonney 1887.” There is no “Bonney 1887” listed in the references. If this is not a typo and should be Bonney 1883, then the reference for Bonney 1887 should be added to the reference list.
8. Page 17, line 491 – citation for “Bonney 1833.” There is no Bonney 1833 listed in the reference list. If this is not a typo and should be Bonney 1883, then the reference for Bonney 1833 should be listed in the reference list.
9. Page 18, line 545 – possible typo; “...abundant **enstatie** and augite.” Should that mineral be **enstatite**?

10. Page 19, lines 555 and 556 – “...undertaken in the early 19th 555 century. During the from 1818 to 1883 the methods and sophistication...” Seems like a word is missing from the sentence beginning with “During.” Perhaps it would read more smoothly like this: “During the **time** from 1818 to 1883...” or “During the **period** from 1818 to 1883...”

11. Page 20, line 599 – where is the Walter E. Helmke Library located? Is it at Purdue or in England?